

Bruce A. Measure  
Chair  
Montana

Rhonda Whiting  
Montana

W. Bill Booth  
Idaho

James A. Yost  
Idaho



Dick Wallace  
Vice-Chair  
Washington

Tom Karier  
Washington

Bill Bradbury  
Oregon

Joan M. Dukes  
Oregon

January 4, 2011

## DECISION MEMORANDUM

**TO:** Council Members

**FROM:** Mark Fritsch, project implementation manager

**SUBJECT:** Council decision on Project #2009-005-00, *Influence of Environment and Landscape on Salmonid Genetics*, a Columbia River Fish Accord project

**PROPOSED ACTION:** The Fish and Wildlife Committee recommends that the Council support the implementation of this project.

### BUDGETARY/ECONOMIC IMPACTS

The total amount associated with this Accord project is \$1,736,257 (e.g., approximately \$140,000 to \$288,601 per year) in expense funds for fiscal years 2008 through 2017. To date, two contracts totaling \$486,124 have been issued. The current contract has a performance period of July 1, 2010 to June 30, 2011 with a contracted amount of \$197,523.<sup>1</sup>

### BACKGROUND

On November 4, 2008, the Council received from Bonneville a set of 11 Columbia Basin Fish Accords proposals. Included in this set was a proposal from the Columbia River Intertribal Fish Commission (CRITFC) for Project #2009-005-00, *Influence of Environment and Landscape on Salmonid Genetics*. The proposal was submitted to the ISRP for review, and on December 12, 2008 the ISRP provided a review (ISRP document 2008-15). The ISRP members requested additional information before they could determine if the proposal met scientific criteria.

The project has two objectives. The first is to determine the effects of watershed/landscape characteristics (e.g., elevations and barriers) to the genetic structure of Chinook and steelhead populations, and the second is to evaluate how environmental conditions influence the phenotypic and genetic expression of traits (e.g., smoltification, thermal tolerance, and disease resistance) as they relate to the recovery of salmonid populations. The project has the potential to contribute to the understanding of how and why life-history adaptive variations of Chinook salmon and steelhead/resident rainbow trout populations are distributed as they are in the

---

<sup>1</sup> Costs to date reflect project planning and purchase of equipment needed for the project.

Columbia River Basin. This information is expected to influence the designation of ESUs in the Columbia River Basin and could provide information that would be helpful to the recovery of listed species, including natural and supplemented populations. For example, this project could identify stocks or individual fish with high potential for anadromy that could be used to increase steelhead abundance in specific drainages.

In their December, 12, 2008 review (ISRP document 2008-15), the ISRP members requested additional information before they could determine if the proposal met scientific criteria.

On January 28, 2009 the ISRP and the Council received a response from the CRITFC, and on February 19, 2009 the Council received the final review from the ISRP (ISRP document 2009-3). The ISRP found that the proposal “Does Not Meet Scientific Review Criteria” because it lacked adequate detail to meet certain review standards.

The ISRP found that the proposed project did not meet review criteria, but appreciated the sponsor’s effort and the information provided to date. In both the preliminary and final review provided by the ISRP, it was noted that the proposal is large and complex. The ISRP found that the proposed project needs additional detail to meet review criteria and recommended that the sponsor provide a study design with the clarity and detail needed for such a progressive and innovative research study.

Based on the need to gather additional details, the Council recommended on March 11, 2009 that the project sponsor continue to design the project for implementation. This recommendation was conditioned on the understanding that the structure and detail associated with the implementation of the project is dependent on a review by the ISRP and Council.

On May 11, 2010 the Council received a submittal intended to address the conditions placed on the project by the Council action on March 11, 2010. The submittal included a cover letter and a revised narrative.

On June 18, 2010 the ISRP provided its follow-up review, which found that the revised narrative was an improvement but that additional detail was needed before a technical review could occur. The ISRP found the submittal did not meet scientific review criteria (ISRP document 2010-21). The ISRP requested a point-by-point response to the items raised in its previous review and requested consideration of further development of the investigation supported by a relevant literature review.

On September 7, 2010 the ISRP had a teleconference with the CRITFC. The teleconference included a PowerPoint presentation. Based on this interaction the CRITFC provided a response report on September 23, 2010 to the Council intended to provide the detail requested by the ISRP.

On November 12, 2010 the ISRP provided its second follow-up review (ISRP document 2010-36) that found the project meeting scientific review criteria (qualified). The ISRP does not expect a response to these qualifications.

Though the ISRP found the project met review criteria, the members expressed concerns about the application of the project (qualification #1) to the region and that in future reviews CRITFC take into account the suggestions offered as part of this most recent review (qualification #2). These suggestions are intended to benefit the project and the use of identifying adaptations of salmon and steelhead to the Columbia River environment and possible selection to improve fitness as a possible recovery action (e.g., focus on biogeographic sampling of steelhead, population selection, and detail associated with laboratory experiments).

On December 14<sup>th</sup> Council staff presented these findings to the Fish and Wildlife Committee. During this discussion further detail was requested regarding the expenditures to date associated with this project and the nature of the scientific review qualification.

## ANALYSIS

### *Scientific Review*

The ISRP determined the project met scientific review criteria with one qualification regarding how new knowledge emerging from this project will be used for implementation in the long run for the recovery of salmonid populations.

This concern regarding future management applications is shared by Council staff, but the project sponsors, many salmon managers and the ISRP recognize the benefits of this project could be substantial. Neither Council staff nor the project sponsor believes it is possible to fully understand the management applications of this research effort at this time. The main intent of this study is to better understand the genes that matter to fish in the field in order to make more informed recovery, conservation, and management decisions. Some primary areas for possible application include the following.

- Improved resolution of ESUs based on functional genes and adaptive potential of populations throughout the Columbia Basin,
- Evaluating genomewide effects of domestication selection
- Selection of stocks that are most appropriate for recovery and reintroduction purposes

Recent advances in both spatial and genetic analysis methods have provided an opportunity to better understand the relationship between fish populations and their environment. Exactly how the information that is learned will be applied to management decisions depends upon the nature of the interactions that will be discovered. The ISRP's qualification states the region should be made aware that this type of information may at some point in the near future be available for managers, and therefore implementation protocols will need to be developed. This was captured in the ISRP final review of the project (ISRP document 2010-36) as follows.

*In summary, the benefits from elucidation of the adaptively relevant genetic structure of both natural and hatchery stocks of both species should be substantial. ... While we are still learning how to pose and answer the appropriate questions, the problem that motivates this proposal is clearly important. It is equally clear that the challenge, even with the modern molecular, statistical and GIS technology at our disposal, remains large. We will have to triangulate the answers from the field, lab, and experimental work to obtain managerially powerful guidance.*

The sponsors believe information gained from this project will not only contribute to better understanding of the adaptation of fish to their environment, but have also explicitly linked this project to related projects<sup>2</sup> that may assist in developing sustainable restoration strategies in the face of the ever-changing environment in the Columbia River Basin (e.g., climate change).

#### *Expenditures to date*

This project was one of the initial Accord proposals submitted to the ISRP in November of 2008. Based on the Council's March 2009 recommendation<sup>3</sup> there have been two contracts associated with this project to date. The total of the two contracts is \$486,124. This amount includes costs associated with study design and pilot studies to further develop the project (primarily salaries and lab supplies), as requested by the ISRP and approved by the Council. In addition, funding for lab equipment was transferred from another project (Project #2009-009-00; see footnote 2 below), which was reviewed by the ISRP and recommended by the Council, to this project in order to provide oversight by CRITFC staff located at the Hagerman genetics lab and also to support multiple relevant Accords projects. This transfer also aids Bonneville's effort to track this expensive and technologically sensitive inventory.

#### **RECOMMENDATION**

Based on the ISRP reviews of this project and the additional detail provided by staff, the Fish and Wildlife Committee recommends that the Council support this project for implementation and that scientific review criteria have been met.

---

<w:\mf\ww\moa 2008-2010\three tribes\submittals\nov4 accord 11 narratives\200900500\010411 critfclandscgeneticdec.docx>

---

<sup>2</sup> Project #2008-907-00, *Genetic Assessment of Columbia River Stock*. As approved by the Council on January 15, 2009 - The objectives of this project are to address needs for distinguishing specific stocks, determine genetic diversity, stock-specific run timing, and estimate stock composition for improved fisheries management and harvest. Through the analysis and evaluation of the single nucleotide polymorphism (SNP) markers the sponsor hopes to expand existing baselines for genetic stock identification (GSI) of salmon and steelhead in the Columbia River Basin.

Project 2009-008-00, *Climate Change Impacts*. Currently in planning mode to coordinate, develop and complete preliminary work with other climate-change modeling efforts in the region. This will help better develop the scope of the project in relationship to other ongoing efforts while gathering existing data for baseline modeling. The expectation is that a proposal will be submitted to the ISRP within the next year.

Project #2009-009-00, *Basinwide Supplementation Evaluation*. As approved by the Council on June 9, 2009, the goal of this project is to support recommendations from the Ad Hoc Supplementation Workgroup (AHSWG 2008) for a basinwide evaluation of the long-term effects of hatchery supplementation on productivity of naturally spawning anadromous salmonid populations. To address this recommendation there is a need for more accurate and precise information on trends in abundance and productivity of supplemented salmon and steelhead populations and relative reproductive success (RRS) of naturally spawning salmon of natural origin versus hatchery origin within supplemented populations.

<sup>3</sup> The initial contract associated with this Council decision had a performance period of July 1, 2009 to June 30, 2010 with a contracted total of \$288,601 (\$149,000 equipment, \$139,601 pilot studies and design).