

W. Bill Booth
Chair
Idaho

James A. Yost
Idaho

Tom Karier
Washington

Dick Wallace
Washington



Bruce A. Measure
Vice-Chair
Montana

Rhonda Whiting
Montana

Melinda S. Eden
Oregon

Joan M. Dukes
Oregon

April 3, 2008

MEMORANDUM

TO: Council members

FROM: Patty O'Toole, Lynn Palensky

SUBJECT: Council work session on Columbia River Basin Fish and Wildlife Program Amendments

The first Council work session for the program amendments process will occur on April 15th as part of the April Council meeting. The deadline for submitting recommendations for amendment the Fish and Wildlife Program is Friday, April 4. The initial staff activity following the deadline is to prepare the recommendations for a public comment period, as required by the Northwest and Power Act. The recommendations will be posted on the Council website the week of April 7, after the deadline. Notice of the sixty-day comment period will be announced to the region via email, regular mail and the Council website. The comment period will close June 13, 2008.

As time allows, staff will prepare a brief overview of the recommendations and distribute to Council members and staff prior to the April meeting. We will discuss the overview at the work session on April 15.

For the afternoon of the 15th we have organized a set of brief presentations by key entities that submitted recommendations. Presenters will provide an overview of their recommendations, either in person or by phone and each will have about 10 minutes for their overview.

As we begin to review the recommendations it will help to be aware of a couple of other key processes and dates. The FCRPS, Snake River projects and the 2008-2017 U.S. v. Oregon Management Agreement biological opinions are due to be release to the public on May 5, 2008. The draft Willamette River projects biological opinion is due to be released July 11, 2008. Memorandums of Agreement between Bonneville and other entities in the basin are anticipated to be available for review prior to the April Council meeting.

W. Bill Booth
Chair
Idaho

James A. Yost
Idaho

Tom Karier
Washington

Dick Wallace
Washington



Bruce A. Measure
Vice-Chair
Montana

Rhonda Whiting
Montana

Melinda S. Eden
Oregon

Joan M. Dukes
Oregon

April 10, 2008

MEMORANDUM

TO: Council members

FROM: Patty O'Toole, Lynn Palensky

SUBJECT: Program amendment recommendations

We are pleased to report that the amendment process for the fish and wildlife program was well received by the region's fish and wildlife agencies and Indian tribes, judging from the volume and thoroughness of the proposals that were submitted by the April 4 deadline. The region's tribes and states are joined in this amendment process by federal agencies, utilities, BPA customers, recovery and watershed planners and several others.

The purpose of this memorandum and the attached table is to provide a broad overview of the amendment proposals and outline the next steps in the amendment process. The attached table provides a high level overview of the proposals.

The Council received 65 sets of recommendations that together, addressing nearly every aspect of the program. The Council received recommendations from 14 tribes, one tribal coordinating entity, four states, and eight federal agencies. In addition, recommendations were received from local and other governmental organizations, non-governmental organization, businesses and individuals.

Many of the recommendations are lengthy and detailed, representing a substantial time and energy investment by the recommending parties. All together, we have a rich and deep reservoir of thousands of pages of recommendations and reference material to work with. All of the amendment proposals and supporting documents submitted with the proposals are posted on the Council's website for public comment (www.nwcouncil.org/fw/program/2008amend/recs.asp). Comments on the recommendations will be accepted through June 12.

The recommendations raise dozens if not hundreds of issues and topics that the Council will have to address through the amendment process. Some of the more obvious important topics raised include whether and how to integrate the new biological opinion, the implementation of MOAs and recovery plans; recommendations that include comparable implementation plans for

parts of the program not covered by the biological opinion and draft MOAs; project and science review; and biological objectives and the monitoring and evaluation framework for the program. Invasive species, climate change, and toxics are relatively new topics that are of interest to many. Staff will continue to assess the recommendations and may provide more analyses at the work session next week.

The recommendations include the draft MOAs Bonneville has negotiated with four tribes (and others may be coming). We will talk about the relationship of these MOAs to on-going and prospective litigation in executive session on Tuesday.

Next steps

The FCRPS Biological Opinion along with the Upper Snake River Biological Opinion and the NOAA Harvest Biological Opinion will be released on May 5th. The Willamette Biological Opinion will be released in July. These biops will likely have a substantial influence on the Council amendment process. The Hatchery Scientific Work Group will be winding up its hatchery reviews over the summer with a scheduled completion date at the end of the fiscal year. Several amendment recommendations urged the Council to incorporate the HSRG products into the Program.

State and central staff will meet on April 22 to begin a discussion of the recommendations and to preliminarily review the many topics that will be covered at upcoming Council work sessions. The schedule and preliminary order for discussion of issues is below.

Schedule for Council work sessions:

Amendment Work Session	Other related activity	Important related dates
April 15 th in Whitefish, 9:00 am until 12:00 pm	1:30 pm to 4:00 pm summary presentations by recommendation submitters	Start public comment on recommendations April 7 th
May 13 th in Walla Walla, 9:00 am until 12:00 pm	Council member’s option to consult with staff, managers and stakeholders in the afternoon	May 5 th -- final FCRPS, Upper Snake and Harvest BiOps due.
June 10 th in Spokane, 9:00 am until 12:00 pm	Council member’s option to consult with staff, managers and stakeholders in the afternoon	End public comment on recommendations June 12 th
July 15 th in Kalispell, 9:00 am until 12:00 pm	Council member’s option to consult with staff, managers and stakeholders in the afternoon	Willamette BiOp due in July
August 12 th in Spokane, 9:00 am until 12:00 pm	Council member’s option to consult with staff, managers and stakeholders in the afternoon	Council decision to release Draft on August 14 th Public comment on draft amendment starts August 15 th

September 16 th in Astoria, 9:00 am to 12:00 pm	Council member's option to consult with staff, managers and stakeholders in the afternoon	Hearings in Astoria, Portland, Spokane, Lewiston, Boise, Pendleton, Yakima and Olympia during September.
October 15 th in Missoula, 9:00 am to 12:00 pm	Council member's option to consult with staff, managers and stakeholders in the afternoon	Hearings in Pablo, Kalispell and Missoula Public comment on draft amendment ends on Oct. 17 th
November 18 th in Coeur d'Alene, 9:00 am to 12:00 pm	Council member's option to consult with staff, managers and stakeholders in the afternoon	Council adopts final amendments on December 11 th .

Possible theme of each work session (subject to change as needed):

April 15th meeting: High level overview of recommendations received, proposed organization and timing for working through the recommendations, proposed high level structure for the draft amended program.

Executive session on legal issues if legal counsel has concerns about the MOA's..

May 13th meeting: Discuss the content of the final Biological opinions for the FCRPS, Upper Snake and Harvest; and consider how all or parts of these documents may be integrated into the structure of the draft amended program. Review and discuss portions of the program that were not targeted by recommendations. Affirm or adjust scientific principles. Discuss the level of detail and specificity that should be in the Program. Discuss if funding should be addressed in the program. Revisit vision, goals and objectives in the program. Also, ...

Possibly hold an executive session on legal issues if legal counsel has concerns about the BiOps or MOA's, or if litigation related to the BiOps requires a response or involvement by the Council.

June 10th meeting: Discuss habitat elements of the draft amended program, how to integrate recovery plans, and intention to carry forward with subbasin plans (including a possible future schedule for updates to the plans). Discuss how to integrate any changes to science review and new project review process into the program. Discuss coordination issues. Discuss current wording and possible changes to the resident fish and wildlife elements of the Program. Conclude habitat discussion. Discuss artificial production, predation, protected areas, the lower river and estuary, toxics, climate and population change effects, invasive species, public information functions and how to integrate these into the program.

July 15th meeting: Discuss Columbia and Snake River hydropower system operations, adult and juvenile passage and survival. Discuss monitoring and evaluation, metrics, reporting and accountability issues. Discuss content and structure of draft program amendment.

August 12th meeting: Final edits to draft program amendment.

September 16th meeting: Discuss under-addressed or outstanding topics.

October 15th meeting: Discuss public comment and possible changes to the draft program amendment.

November 18th meeting: Discuss final proposed program amendment. Make final edits to the final draft. Also, ...

Brief assessment of recommendations

Entity name	Brief assessment of recommendation
Oregon Department of Fish and Wildlife	Recommendation endorses CBFWA submission. Four attachments: Includes mark-up of current program, mark-up of 2003 mainstem amendments, summary of additional recommendations, and projects and measures. Topics include hydro ops, wildlife, RM&E, resident fish, habitat, hatcheries
Oregon Department of Fish and Wildlife Mid-Columbia District	Recommendation endorses Hood River Watershed Group's Hood River Watershed Action Plan.
Idaho Department of Fish and Game/Office of Species Conservation	Joint recommendations of IDFG, OSC and State of Idaho. Recommendation supports CBFWA submission. Topics include: resident fish substitution, anadromous fish, wildlife, blocked area mitigation, research, data management, coordination. Recommendations are organized into strategies and measures, organized by anadromous/resident/wildlife, then by province, subbasin, species, population. Measures are presented in context of specific limiting factors, implementation timeframes and expected response timeframes.
Montana Fish, Wildlife and Parks	A set of 11 recommended amendments. Topics include: reduce the cost of project planning and increase funding for implementation, develop a Dedicated Contingency Fund, support stronghold basins, mitigated losses of fish habitat caused by filling Hungry Horse and Libby Reservoirs.
Office of the Governor, Washington/WDFW	Recommendations include recognition of recovery office recommendations, recovery plans, RM&E, HSRG, climate change and population growth, nutrient enhancement, project review and selection, CBWTP. WDFW recommends endorsement of CBFWA submission.
Upper Columbia Salmon Recovery Board	Recommendation emphasis is subbasin plans, basinwide strategies. Incorporate the implementation schedule in the recovery plan. Recognize the critical research uncertainties that the recovery plan identifies. Some Monitoring and data management discussion. HSRG - Board would like the Council to review the recommendations of the HSRG before implementation.
Yakima Basin Fish and Wildlife Recovery Board	Recommendation to recognize the Yakima steelhead recovery plan, implementation schedule, incorporate board role into Council project review process, commit to key monitoring actions.
Lower Columbia Fish Recovery Board	Recommendation to recognize the Lower Columbia River Recovery Plan, provide for consistency between Program and recovery plan, RM&E, Implementation Coordination and Project Review, Columbia Basin Hatchery Review
Snake River Salmon Recovery Board	Recommendations include 1) an adaptive-management "architecture" as the framework of the program; 2) implement the program consistent with the Snake River Salmon Recovery Plan; 3) increase monitoring and evaluation of projects and results; 4) develop consistency and collaboration in program implementation and data management; 4) emphasize needed survival improvements in the mainstem Snake and Columbia rivers.
Washington Forum on Monitoring	Recommendations to use the Washington Comprehensive Monitoring Strategy and Action Plan as a guide to writing specific monitoring and evaluation language into the program focusing on highest priority monitoring and evaluation questions first. Consider the example of the annual Washington State of the Salmon in Watersheds reports, the Oregon Plan reports and the PCSRF annual reports as guides in producing an annual M&E report. Get data sharing agreements in place.

Brief assessment of recommendations

Entity name	Brief assessment of recommendation
Confederated Tribes of the Warm Springs Reservation of Oregon	Recommendation includes the draft MOA with Bonneville/COE/BOR. MOA's cover hydro performance/operations, lamprey, lamprey passage, habitat and hatchery commitments, implementation provision of the MOAs, RM&E, (narrowly discussed)project lists with annual average \$\$, steelhead issues (ops, kelt program, conservation enforcement, Spring Creek Hatchery. Biological benefits assessment still in development. Recommendation endorses CBFWA submission.
Confederated Tribes of the Umatilla Indian Reservation	Recommendation includes the draft MOA with Bonneville/COE/BOR. MOA's cover hydro performance/operations, lamprey, lamprey passage, habitat and hatchery commitments, implementation provision of the MOAs, RM&E, (narrowly discussed)project lists with annual average \$\$, steelhead issues (ops, kelt program, conservation enforcement, Spring Creek Hatchery. Biological benefits assessment still in development. Recommendation endorses CBFWA submission.
Yakama Nation	Recommendation includes the draft MOA with Bonneville/COE/BOR. MOA's cover hydro performance/operations, lamprey, lamprey passage, habitat and hatchery commitments, implementation provision of the MOAs, RM&E, (narrowly discussed)project lists with annual average \$\$, steelhead issues (ops, kelt program, conservation enforcement, Spring Creek Hatchery. Biological benefits assessment still in development. Recommendation endorses CBFWA submission.
Nez Perce Tribe	Recommends measures that implement the subbasin plans for the next ten years. Includes estimated biological benefit that would result from the actions. Included are artificial production and habitat measures with on-the-ground and m&e components with timing considerations.
The Confederated Tribes of the Colville Reservation	Recommendation includes the draft MOA with Bonneville/COE/BOR. MOA covers hydro actions, Habitat (including specific projects/work), hatchery and harvest, RME, non-ESA actions. Recommends endorsement of CBFWA document and UCUT recommendations.
Coeur d'Alene Tribe	Endorsement of CBFWA, UCUT and includes CDA specifics include specific measures. Specific emphasis of some recommendations in the CBFWA submission; section 1, section 3 and section 4. Emphasis on section 2.3 (wildlife) and section 5. Emphasis on in lieu provisions. CDA specific recommendations include emphasis on Resident Fish Substitution in the Coeur d'Alene, and Spokane subbasins, wildlife mitigation.
Spokane Tribe	Repeats the recommendations of the UCUT Tribes (see below). Adds to that a recommendation to implement the Spokane Tribe's 10-year implementation plan of aquatic and terrestrial measures and recommendations concerning coordination and consultation.
Kalispel Tribe	Repeats the recommendations of the UCUT Tribes (see below). Adds to that a recommendation to implement a set of specific mitigation measures over the next ten years and recommendations concerning coordination and consultation.
Kootenai Tribe of Idaho	Recommends endorsement of CBFWA and UCUT recommendations. Recommend Libby Dam operational changes and related habitat improvements in the river (VARQ and a "sliding refill date"; 2) an adaptive management program with five core projects (these already are in the program); 3) 10-year funding periods for the projects in the adaptive management program; 4) changes in the operation and management of the Fish Passage Center.

Brief assessment of recommendations

Entity name	Brief assessment of recommendation
Confederated Salish-Kootenai Tribes	Recommends that resident fish mitigation should be at least 1:1 in lost habitat. Maintain 70/15/15. Reassess wildlife impacts using HEP. Attached tribal council resolution endorses CBFWA recommendations.
Upper Columbia United Tribes	Recommend the program include provision to size the resident fish substitution program commensurate with the magnitude of anadromous fish losses. Affirm 70-15-15 policy, but shift 10% of the anadromous spending to mitigate for lost anadromous fish in the blocked areas (resulting in a 60-25-25 allocation). Support BPA's 70-25-5 distribution percentage for on-the ground, m&e and administration. Strengthen adaptive management for existing projects and use targeted RFPs for new work. Support Upper Columbia ecoregion monitoring instead of individual project monitoring. Initiate model watersheds in the UCUT area. Clarify in-lieu policy. Ensure long term wildlife O&M funding.
Burns Paiute Tribe	Recommends that the Program incorporate Clean Water Act integration more fully and explicitly; in particular TDG and temperature. Restore Chinook to the Malheur subbasin to 25% of original population levels. Support CBFWA recommendations and is interested in the Council developing principles to guide BPA in interpreting the in-lieu provisions of the NWPA. These principles should be incorporated into the program. Also per-project cost sharing should be more clearly defined.
Shoshone Paiute Tribes	Endorsement of CBFWA recommendations. Recommendations include six specific recommendations. Includes: language modifications to refer to "currently blocked" habitat instead of "eliminated habitat"; language modification for the "Substitution for anadromous fish losses" section of the program that the Council support funding for key specific projects; language modification to the wildlife section to read "Bonneville and the fish and wildlife managers should complete mitigation agreements for the remaining habitat units. These agreements should equal 200 percent of the habitat units (2:1 ratio)". Recommendations include additional language regarding wildlife losses and carry over the table of wildlife losses to the amended program; and that Operational Loss Assessments need to be initiated in 2009 and completed in 2012.
Shoshone-Bannock Tribes	Recommendations include: 1) Fund the Tribes to investigate the feasibility of reintroducing anadromous and resident salmonids to Yellow Belly Lake, Panther Creek, Slate Creek, Basin Creek, and other headwater streams where anadromous fish no longer exist; 2) fund the Tribes to apply nutrients to selected streams in the Salmon River Basin; 3) fund the Tribes to complete the Yankee Fork Salmon River project; 4) include specific actions in the program that optimize in-river passage conditions by spilling to the gas caps, within biological constraints, as determined by the state, tribal and federal salmon management agencies; 5) the program should reflect state, tribal, and federal policy that transportation of smolts, consistent with the recommended full spill program, is based upon a spread-the-risk strategy between juvenile fish passage in-river and juvenile fish transported, with no more than 50 percent of each population group being transported; 6) continue Fish Passage Center funding (includes a list of specific duties); 7) include a strategy or action to study the reintroduction of anadromous fish above Hells Canyon Dam.

Brief assessment of recommendations

Entity name	Brief assessment of recommendation
Confederated Tribes of the Grand Ronde	<p>Recommendations include: Allocation of Program resources by Province: the Lower Columbia Province, the most populated province, the most affected by human development and with some of the highest real estate values in the basin, merits more than 2 percent of the total Program budget because of the direct and indirect effects of the province's many hydroelectric projects. The vast majority of wildlife mitigation credits in the Willamette subbasin are still due; the Program should transform these credits into actual wildlife habitat and recovery projects in the Willamette subbasin.</p> <p>Recommendations for the Lower Columbia Province and Willamette Subbasin: Consistent with its subbasin plan, opportunities exist in the Willamette Subbasin to improve passage, restore habitats, reintroduce populations to historic reaches, and increase our knowledge and understanding of species and populations, thereby reaching biological objectives for the Lower Columbia Province.</p> <p>Specific recommendations made in areas of biological objectives for the Province; addressing primary limiting factors and threats with specific province-wide strategies and</p>
NOAA Fisheries	11 specific recommendations including: Program should recognize 2008 Federal Columbia River Power System (FCRPS) and Upper Snake Biological Opinions, Adopt the 10 year agreements, implementation of recovery plans.
NOAA Fisheries - NW Science Center	Recommend the program an intention to implement Hatchery Reform Best Management Practices (BMPs) in full.
USFWS	<p>Recommendations include: increased focus on lamprey, development and implementation of Hatchery Reform Best Management Practices, development and implementation of best management practices for tagging and marking, recognize threats related to invasive species, recognize current efforts to reintroduce salmon and steelhead in blocked areas, consider implementing salmon strongholds, promote projects to remove infrastructure to improve habitat, recommends caution when considering action for cormorants, Reserved final endorsement of CBFWA recommendations. Abstaining from CBFWA Section 5.1.</p>
COE/BOR	<p>The Corps and the Bureau recommend that the Council amend the Program to integrate all actions contained in the three upcoming NOAA BiOps such that the actions in these BiOps are implemented as measures to protect, mitigate and enhance listed salmon and steelhead affected by the hydropower system. The two federal agencies also recommend adoption into the Program of all the actions contained in executed draft 10-year MOAs between the action agencies and Tribes and States, and that these actions are implemented as additional measures to protect, mitigate and enhance listed and non-listed fish.</p>

Brief assessment of recommendations

Entity name	Brief assessment of recommendation
BPA	<p>BPA indicates it will be submitting to Council an edited and redlined 2000 F&WL Program. Recommendations include: Scope of Program: off-site mitigation projects should be tied to BPA's remaining mitigation responsibilities after accounting for benefits of on-site mitigation. Partnerships and shared responsibilities: BPA's responsibility for off-site mitigation unrelated to FCRPS should be shared with parties responsible for those off-site impacts. Limit scope of ratepayer obligation: BPA ratepayers should bear only the cost of actions to mitigate for hydroelectric facilities. F&WL mitigation should be comprised of on-the-ground projects that mitigate hydropower impacts directly. Use best available science: Program amendments should be based on, and use, the best available science and scientific reviews. Use ecosystem-based perspective: Program strategies and measures should be evaluated using an ecosystem-based approach. Account for systemwide hydropower mitigation plans:</p> <p>The Program should reflect systemwide mitigation planning by incorporating and accounting for all federal and federally-licensed (FERC) hydropower facility mitigation plans.</p>
US EPA	Recommend to give consideration to toxics reduction and recovery, water temperatures.
DOI/USGS	Recommendations include: the Program should recognize the potential deleterious effects of invasive species on recovery efforts for Pacific salmon and resident fishes. Initiate and implement an early detection monitoring program. Focus is on key biological resources and habitats, contaminants (especially in the Estuary) and invasive species, and groundwater effects on habitat quality.
Fish and Wildlife Agencies and Tribes collectively through CBFWA	Comprehensive re-write of the Program. NOAA and USFWS abstained from Section 5.1.
Benewah County	Benewah County recommends policy changes sufficient to implement consultation with local governments as required by law. It is further recommended that the patent bias by BPA in favor of Tribes over state and local governments as a means of gaining information, recommendations or as vehicles of wildlife enhancement be abandoned as inconsistent with the Northwest Power Act and the Constitution of the United States.
City of Portland	The lower Willamette River provides key habitat for listed Columbia River salmon, steelhead and lamprey. Protecting and restoring habitat in the lower Willamette River should be a focus area for the Council's Program because of its importance to the recovery of multiple Willamette and Columbia river salmon ESUs, as well as one of the Columbia Basin's strongest lamprey populations. The city recommends two sets of specific RM&E actions for both salmon and steelhead as well as Pacific lamprey.
Hood River Watershed Group	The Hood River Watershed Group hereby submits the attached "2008 Hood River Watershed Action Plan" as the specific implementation strategy (plan), as part of the Hood River Subbasin Plan. Since this plan is still pending consensus approval by the Hood River Watershed Group, they intend to submit the final approved document during the upcoming recommendation comment period.
Pacific States Marine Fisheries Commission	Main topic is aquatic nuisance (or invasive) species. Program should more clearly recognize the threat and incorporate measures to address.
Ad Hoc Supplementation Work Group. (Quantitative Consultants).	Submits its "Final Draft Report of the Ad Hoc Supplementation Monitoring and Evaluation Workgroup" for consideration.

Brief assessment of recommendations

Entity name	Brief assessment of recommendation
Columbia Basin Water Transactions Program	To meet the needs of salmonids and other aquatic species, the Council should continue the CBWTP to pursue expansion of water right acquisitions, including associated transaction costs, in subbasins where water quantity has been identified as a primary limiting factor to meet biological objectives within subbasin plans. Also expand an integrated land and water acquisition program, under the pilot Riparian Conservation Easement Program, to other priority anadromous fish habitat areas.
Lower Columbia River Estuary Partnership	Recommendations include role of the estuary, relationship between Program and LCREP. Recommendations relating to habitat protection and restoration, rm&e, water quality monitoring and toxics.
East Columbia Basin Irrigation District	The ECBID recommends that the Council amend the Program as follows: Modify the M&E framework to clearly establish the objectives of the Program. Implement additional research concerning the ocean environment and conditions as they affect ESA-listed stocks, with reduced research efforts within the Columbia River Basin. Provide simple Program descriptions including milestones, estimated costs and objectives to increase accountability. Adjust river operations to minimize gas entrainment and spills; continue to support surface bypass facilities. Increase efforts in public information and education about the Program.
Pacific Northwest Generating Cooperative	The power industry's proposed amendments are based on 5 primary principles: the Program vision & strategies should address mitigation of hydropower impacts, rather than all human caused impact; the Program should provide guiding principles and avoid prescriptive details; the hydrosystem mitigation directed by teh Program should complement other ongoing regional actions; the Program should prioritize projects that directly benefit fish and wildlife and share costs with other agencies; Program should provide an ecologically based framework that creates clear priorities.
Pacific Northwest Utilities Conference Committee	The power industry's proposed amendments are based on 5 primary principles: the Program vision & strategies should address mitigation of hydropower impacts, rather than all human caused impact; the Program should provide guiding principles and avoid prescriptive details; the hydrosystem mitigation directed by teh Program should complement other ongoing regional actions; the Program should prioritize projects that directly benefit fish and wildlife and share costs with other agencies; Program should provide an ecologically based framework that creates clear priorities.
Public Power Council	The power industry's proposed amendments are based on 5 primary principles: the Program vision & strategies should address mitigation of hydropower impacts, rather than all human caused impact; the Program should provide guiding principles and avoid prescriptive details; the hydrosystem mitigation directed by teh Program should complement other ongoing regional actions; the Program should prioritize projects that directly benefit fish and wildlife and share costs with other agencies; Program should provide an ecologically based framework that creates clear priorities.

Brief assessment of recommendations

Entity name	Brief assessment of recommendation
Northwest River Partners	The power industry's proposed amendments are based on 5 primary principles: the Program vision & strategies should address mitigation of hydropower impacts, rather than all human caused impact; the Program should provide guiding principles and avoid prescriptive details; the hydrosystem mitigation directed by the Program should complement other ongoing regional actions; the Program should prioritize projects that directly benefit fish and wildlife and share costs with other agencies; Program should provide an ecologically based framework that creates clear priorities.
Wild Salmon Center	Recommend the establishment of a Columbia Basin Salmon Stronghold Partnership Fund.
Stewardship Partners	Recommend that actively engaging private landowners in the conservation and restoration actions being undertaken by the council be a priority and be included in the plan with more detail and emphasis. Recommend the Council support Salmon-Safe as a tool with proven success for achieving this. recommends that Bonneville Power Administration (BPA) establish a fund specifically for new or unique partnerships that result in or directly support tangible habitat improvements in the Columbia River Basin
Northwest Habitat Institute	Recommends funding and implementing Wildlife-Habitat Relationships in Oregon and Washington and its Integrated Habitat and Biodiversity Information System (IBIS). Adopt the Wildlife-Habitat Relationships in Oregon and Washington, and A Strategy for Managing Fish, Wildlife, and Habitat Data - Columbia River Basin Framework.
Clark Fork Coalition	Recommends that the Council include provisions for protecting, mitigating and enhancing the resident fish and wildlife populations within the headwaters of the Columbia River system. Recommends maintaining or increasing the current level of funding (15%) for resident fish projects. Recommend maintaining or expanding the water and land acquisition fund. Recommends the Council fund the writing and adopting of a subbasin plan for the upper Clark Fork. Consider adopting some or all of the actions outlined in the "River Vision 2020: Upper Clark Fork Restoration Program
Northwest Sportsfishing Industry Association	Recommend maintaining continuity with past amendments, consider enhancing the role of the FPC to include monitoring Steelhead in the smolt monitoring program, recommend that the funding level for the FPC be adequate for the mission it is created to accomplish, recommend that some form of mediation or conflict resolution be used to get at causes of the controversy surrounding the FPC, recommend that the NPCC and the Federal agencies integrate the ESA actions into the Program, Develop Information Concerning the Economic Benefits of Sportfishing in the Columbia Basin, Conduct an Objective Study of the Costs and Benefits of Removing the Four Lower Snake River Dams.
Yakima Basin Environmental Education Program	Continue funding the Yakima Basin Environmental Education Program.
Deschutes Basin Board of Control	The DBBC recommends that the Council amend the Program as follows: Clearly define offsite mitigation, Conservation projects that benefit fish and wildlife and create renewable energy resources should be recognized for multiple benefits and get additional ranking in subbasin ranking project process, BPA funding should be recognized as a non-federal match since it comes from regional ratepayers.

Brief assessment of recommendations

Entity name	Brief assessment of recommendation
Kintama Research Corporation	Emphasize ocean research in the program. Measure more accurately time for smolts to exit the hydrosystem. Study survival below Bonneville dam. Refutes delayed mortality hypothesis
Natural Solutions, Tod Jones	Recommendation supports a proposal to re-establish self-perpetuating runs of chum salmon in a significant number of the approximate thirty streams that once supported viable chum populations. This proposal would be funded primarily by private sources however, it would engage and encourage other funding sources to insure high quality research, monitoring and evaluation.
John McKern, Fish Passage Solutions	Recommendation emphasizes measures that have been taken to improve fish survival through the hydrosystem, and suggest that the effects of the hydropower system have been pretty much mitigated. Recommends a refocused effort on ocean survival.
Thomas Schenk, Columbia Land and Timber, LLC	Recommends funding for market-based approaches with proven track records for producing tangible deliverables, e.g., helping ranchers capture multi-agency cost share for conservation incentive projects to improve habitat on private lands.
Charles Pace	Comprehensive re-write of the Program.
Fish Passage Solutions	There is mounting evidence that survival of juvenile and adult salmon through the hydropower system has increased markedly in recent years, e.g., the effects of the hydropower system have been pretty much mitigated. There is also mounting evidence that survival in the ocean is not only causing severe fluctuations in Columbia River salmon stocks, but also in stocks from other river basins like the Fraser River in British Columbia. Thus, the Council should implement additional research concerning the ocean environment and rearing conditions as they affect ESA-listed stocks. In particular, more research is recommended in area of where ESA-listed salmon reside in the ocean and what factors affect ocean survival. In addition, new and expanded research and management programs, as well as increased international cooperation, is recommended to identify stocks of salmon are being overharvested, where forage fish or other food sources are being overharvested, and where aquaculture or industrial practices affect salmon survival.
John Baugher	Recommends that the Council should “seek out and give considerable credence to BPA COTRs” prior to making any project funding proposal recommendations.
Mark Booker	Recommendation to redirect fish and wildlife resources toward areas of large potential benefit; simplify the Monitoring and Evaluation Framework, clearly establish objectives and adhere to an economic theory of measurement; increase emphasis on projects and research concerning the ocean environment; decrease effort on projects within the Columbia-Snake River Basin with low potential benefit; adjust river operations to reduce gas entrapment, returning to earlier lower management levels; use the small weir method for downstream dam passage; begin a new and expanded effort to directly inform and educate the public and ratepayers about fish and wildlife.
John Farrar	Recommends removal of Enloe Dam on the Similkameen River.

Brief assessment of recommendations

Entity name	Brief assessment of recommendation
Dean Gentry	Recommendations include review the procedures and accuracy of the method used to determine habitat units lost. Review the accuracy of the habitat units credited to the BPA for each of the properties acquired. Establish a moratorium of acquisitions of any additional property for a period of at least five years. Focus all management activities and the use of available funds on enhancement and management of those properties which have already been purchased for mitigation; encourage the participants to enhance and manage suitable property they presently own to attain additional HU credits to the BPA. Insist on a higher standard of property appraisals for any and all future land acquisitions to assure the best value for the funds use. Decision criteria should include a minimum number of habitat units per acre -- such as 1.5 or 2.0 -- existing at the time of acquisition and a minimum goal of at least 4.0 habitat units per acre with proper enhancement and management. Demand that BPA follow the Northwest Power Act. The Council should make a greater effort to encourage and bring about more public involvement in its meetings.
Sam Kaser	This individual provides Program recommendations in the following areas: Predator control, particularly for sea lions. Do not remove dams. Salmon harvest. Base the Program on sound, objective science
Robert Kelly	Recommend that the Council support ammendment of the MMPA.
Russell Ladley	Recommends that the NPCC direct energy and interest toward reestablishing anadromous fish to the upper Columbia River